

Book Reviews

THE VARIETIES OF BELIEF. *Paul Helm.* Allen & Unwin, 1973. 189 pp. £3.75.

It is currently fashionable in philosophical theology to bypass the verification problem by claiming that questions of meaningfulness can only be dealt with from within religious language and the form of life that it articulates. The first half of Paul Helm's book criticises various versions of this thesis both on general epistemological grounds and also because the 'believer' whose language is appealed to cannot be identified. In the second he argues that in fact believers differ in their accounts of what it is to believe, quoting Locke and Butler, Calvin and John Owen, Kant and Wittgenstein, and John Hick as examples of four distinct and irreconcilable approaches, and pointing out that different epistemologies set different limits not only to certainty and acceptable evidence but also to the possible content of belief. Too much Christian dialogue founders because it does not take into account the pluralism to which Helm draws attention. It is not his purpose to do more than draw attention to it. His standpoint is professionally neutral, though his sympathy with the Reformers is clear, and his attempt to clarify Owen's doctrine of belief as acceptance of self-authenticating divine testimony and to set it in a modern context is in many ways the most valuable part of the book. The Reformed position is too often dismissed as obscurantist. Helm does much to vindicate it, though he admits that to accept it is to leave vital questions of hermeneutic unanswered. FRANKLYN DULLEY

INTRODUCTION TO THE BIBLE. *John H. Hayes.* SPCK, 1973. 515 pp. £2.95.

This book was first published in the USA in 1971. The author is Associate Professor of Religion at Trinity University, San Antonio, Texas. The book has proved its worth on the other side of the Atlantic and has therefore been given a British edition, which, though paper covered, is very good value for money. In addition to the large amount of printed matter there is on each page, we are given a considerable selection of illustrations and a number of maps at the end.

Professor Hayes takes as his basic standpoint that of the modern biblical theology movement. He normally accepts majority critical conclusions but

believes that 'God has revealed his purpose and will primarily through the series of crucial historical events which comprise the Biblical narrative and that these events demand an appropriate response of faith and obedience'. He is aware of more conservative views but these, like the more radical ones, are not given much reference in the text of the book. There are however a considerable number of footnotes and a good-sized bibliography which should promote further study.

This is not a work of great originality but for those who wish for a good comprehensive statement of the approach to biblical history and literature taken by the majority of biblical scholars in the Anglo-Saxon world it will prove itself to be of considerable usefulness.

ROBIN NIXON

WINDING QUEST: THE HEART OF THE OLD TESTAMENT IN PLAIN ENGLISH. Alan T. Dale. OUP. 432 pp. £4.00.

Beautifully produced, superbly illustrated and cleverly written here is a most useful aid for the discerning school teacher as well as a delight to every lover of the Old Testament. Dr. Dale's retelling of the core of the Old Testament is a treat. Vividness, realism and sympathetic understanding of men and situations can go no further. Is it not exactly right that Jehu is represented as shouting, 'Peace be damned! Fall in behind me'; is not Abner's hurt spirit precisely caught in the plaint 'Am I scum from the South?' The familiar interpretative translation 'a still small voice' becomes 'a silence so deep that it was almost a sound itself'. To Jeremiah the Lord promised 'I stand wakeful over my word to make it my deed'—and the list could be endlessly prolonged. The book is planned so that we are first introduced to Israel in their hey-day: the period of David (some very perceptive comments here on Saul as 'the beloved captain'). Then we step back in time to discover how they came to this zenith (Moses through to Judges), and next forward to the 'death of two cities', the end of the monarchies, and the work of Nehemiah and Ezra (in that order). Some psalms (beautifully paraphrasing here also) follow to show how history was interpreted in song and worship and this is continued by showing prophetic interpretation of history as represented by Amos, Jeremiah and Deutero-Isaiah. The book concludes by introducing and paraphrasing Genesis, Job and some more psalms. It is honestly hard not to see this rather curious order of events as a blemish or to find good reason why such a skilful author could not have made an equally good job by taking the OT as it stands: certainly from the teaching point of view this would have made life in the classroom easier. Nevertheless no school library should be without this book and no reader will depart unrewarded.

J. A. MOTYER

HISTORY OF ISRAELITE RELIGION. Georg Fohrer (translated by David E. Green). SPCK. 416 pp. £4.95.

This is a translation of Professor Fohrer's *Lehrbuch* which was first published in 1969 (not 1968 as stated on the dust cover) under the title *Geschichte der israelitischen Religion*. The *Lehrbuch* has long played an important part in the education of German students, and it has no real equivalent in British practice. Its aim is to summarise the scholarly position in a particular field, and to provide the bibliographical information necessary for first-hand study. The volume under review will thus probably be more used by English students as a book of reference, than as something to be read from cover to cover.

Its summaries are masterly, and its documentation is massive.

The book deals with the religion of Israel as it was practised in four main periods: the Early Period (before the Monarchy), the Monarchy, the Exilic Period, and the Post-Exilic Period. Of these four sections, that on the monarchy is by far the largest, and includes a long sub-section on prophecy, and smaller sections on topics such as kingship, worship, and life and death. Although he gives a fair statement of current critical opinion, Professor Fohrer presses his own views with vigour, in some cases arguing strongly against the predominant schools in Germany. Thus he has a positive view of the work and person of Moses, allows that Exodus 1-15 has a basis in historical fact, refuses to divorce the Sinai and Exodus traditions, and rejects the amphictyony theory. It is also welcome to read his cautious treatment of Canaanite religion, and to note his warning that 'for the time being, the only sure evidence for dying and rising gods dates from the Christian era' (p. 55).

The translation reads well, but it is not always secure, and free from ambiguity; one or two errors have crept into the bibliographies. While one strongly welcomes the English form of the *Lehrbuch*, the reader must be reminded that it is a scholarly, and thus to some extent a hypothetical reconstruction of the history of Israelite religion. It should not be confused with an exposition of the witness of the Old Testament to the revelation of the God and Father of our Lord, Jesus Christ. J. W. ROGERSON

MAN AND HIS HOPE IN THE OLD TESTAMENT. *Walther Zimmerli*
SCM Studies in Biblical Theology. 174 pp. £2.25.

The impetus for producing the series of lectures on which this book was based came from Ernst Bloch's philosophical masterpiece, *Das Prinzip Hoffnung*, which was written in the USA during the war years but revised subsequently and published in its final (?) form in Germany in 1959. There must be few with sufficient Germanic thoroughness to have ploughed steadily through Bloch's massive volume (over 1,500 pp.), but the influence of his writing was very considerable and Zimmerli has done Old Testament scholars a service in examining afresh the concept of hope in the Old Testament in order to assess, and ultimately to diverge from, Bloch's own conclusions (or assumptions).

The lectures demonstrate the measure of Zimmerli's stature as linguist, theologian and philosopher, a spanning of disciplines which few of his readers can share. But for the most part he comes through as a linguist, scrutinising the Hebrew roots and forms relevant to his theme with accuracy and clarity. After observing the relative simplicity of New Testament vocabulary, where *elpis* and *elpizein* cover as much as one needs to know about the Christian's hope, he shows up the extreme complexity of Hebrew terminology where 'hoping', 'waiting', 'trusting', 'looking', all represent roots which have to be taken into consideration.

His chief concern is with *šbr*, *qwh*, *yhl* and *bḥ*, but beyond the words there are of course the ideas which do not necessarily incorporate the actual terminology. So this is much more than a long plod through a concordance. For convenience the Old Testament is divided into sections and statements about hope are examined in Proverbs and Job, the Psalms, the Yahwist and Priestly histories, the Deuteronomist, the eighth-century prophets, the prophets of the last days of Judah (Nahum, Habakkuk, Jeremiah and Ezekiel), Second Isaiah and Apocalyptic. His conclusion is that for Hebrew

man hope begins where hopelessness is reached; there was never any 'principle of hope' which was always generally believed by man. 'It was precisely where the sharpest criticisms of hope were loudest, that man in a frightening recklessness threw himself' upon God. Of this Job was the outstanding example, though the Messianism that grew out of the apparent end of the Davidic line could also be adduced.

While philosophers engaged in dialogue over Bloch's position will be glad to draw on Zimmerli's detailed researches, most students of the Old Testament will accept them as a contribution to the linguistics and theology of the Old Testament *per se* and do nothing more than doff the cap to Bloch for having been the ultimate cause which brought this valuable work to birth.

JOHN B. TAYLOR

EXODUS: TYNDALE OLD TESTAMENT COMMENTARIES. *Alan Cole*. Tyndale Press, 1973. 239 pp. £1.35.

Dr. Alan Cole's commentary on the book of Exodus stands up very well in comparison with the two other 'popular' commentaries on Exodus which have been published in recent years, namely that by Henton Davies in the *Torch* series, and that by Hyatt in the *New Century Bible*. Indeed, in some ways, students will find Dr. Cole's commentary to be the most useful of the three. It has two outstanding features. The first is the refusal to dodge any major problem raised by the text, and although one may not always agree with the solutions proposed, one is grateful for the careful presentation of the problems as well as consideration of alternative possible solutions. The second important feature is the long section in the introduction entitled 'The Theology of Exodus'. This occupies some twenty pages and provides an invaluable framework in terms of which to understand the more detailed comments on the text. One does hope, however, that students will not conclude that they can understand Exodus simply by reading this introduction! It would be a shame if an otherwise admirable feature of the commentary were to divert attention away from the actual biblical text.

Dr. Cole rejects the Documentary Hypothesis, and allows that much of the material is eyewitness material in origin. In the reviewer's opinion, this sometimes creates unnecessary difficulties. For example, in discussing the pillar of cloud by day, Dr. Cole argues that the origin of the symbol (for he rightly stresses that it is a symbol of the divine presence) is perhaps in something like a whirlwind which was seen in the camp. This is not the only supernatural element in the narratives whose origin is explained by recourse to a curiously old-fashioned rationalist point of view. It is clear what Dr. Cole is trying to safeguard; while admitting that the pillar of cloud (and similar manifestations) is a symbol, he wishes to anchor the symbol in some sort of objectivity. Yet it needs to be asked whether the *reality* was not in fact the sense of the presence and guidance of God in the wilderness, which was then expressed in the record by means of the traditional symbols of God's presence, namely fire and cloud. A look at Exodus in the light of the Psalms might have helped here, as also in the case of the tradition of the plagues, where Dr. Cole neglects the importance of Psalms 78 and 105. The point at issue may seem to be marginal, but it is part of the larger issue of how we handle supernatural elements in biblical narratives, and one feels that Dr. Cole's desire to establish some sort of *historical* origin for each occurrence of a symbol for divine transcendence, needs a lot more thought.

This matter apart, however, not only students, but teachers will be grateful for the careful and detailed work which has gone into the production of this commentary.

J. W. ROGERSON

TWENTY-FIVE PSALMS FROM A MODERN LITURGICAL PSALTER. Church Information Office, 1973. 46 pp. £0.55.

This is a pilot scheme for a new liturgical psalter, suitable for use in services in modern language such as Series 3 Holy Communion. The selected psalms are published now in order that the project may benefit from comment and criticism from a wider public.

The translation is the work of Dr. David Frost, a Cambridge Shakespearean scholar, and he has tried to make his version intelligible to users unfamiliar with older ones. Fortunately he has allowed full scope to his preference for language with poetic depths of meaning, and it has seemed 'quite appropriate that the psalms should appear in modern services as a somewhat older, more poetic, more foreign stratum of material'. The draft translations are followed by interpretative notes occupying nearly as much space; these for the most part elucidate questions of text and interpretation of the Hebrew underlying the translations. Dr. Frost has been assisted by a Hebraist, the Rev. Andrew Macintosh.

On the whole this is a good piece of work. Inevitably individual judgments will vary: the reviewer regrets 'face' for 'presence' in 95: 2, but welcomes 'note' for 'mark' in 130: 3. 'Do not harden your hearts as a Dispute: as on that day at Testing in the wilderness' seems only a slight improvement on the Revised Psalter's Meribah and Massah (95: 8). Surely the unlearned user needs something like 'the place of Dispute' and 'that day of Testing'. In general the attitude to the Massoretic text is much more cautious than that of the Revised Psalter.

A. GELSTON

ISAIAH 1-39: THE CAMBRIDGE BIBLE COMMENTARY. A. S. Herbert. CUP. 1973. 219 pp. £3.60.

This series of commentaries attempts to 'convey the latest and best scholarship' to the layman, though students and ministers are also envisaged in its readership. The present volume, after twenty-three pages of introduction, comprises alternating sections of the New English Bible text and comments. The sections seem to correspond to what are regarded as originally separate oracles.

The requirements of the series impose severe limitations on the commentator. In the present case, for instance, he is bound to follow the New English Bible's transposition of 5: 24-25 to follow 10: 4, though the complementary connection of 10: 1-4 with 5: 8-23 can only be noticed in a single sentence. Space forbids any adequate discussion of such a passage as the Immanuel prophecy of 7: 14. Nor is there room for a sufficiently clear explanation of the reasons why 11: 10-16 must be regarded as post-exilic. Similarly the historical problems relating to Sennacherib's invasion in chapters 36 and 37 have to be outlined in a couple of pages.

Within these limitations Professor Herbert has produced a useful and balanced commentary. But a student who equipped himself with a copy of the New English Bible and the new Peake's Commentary would possess a comparable amount of help for the *whole* of the Bible. One cannot help wondering who will be able to afford to buy volumes at this price which

contain relatively so little in the way of commentary, and that little circumscribed by the judgments embodied in the New English Bible translation of the Old Testament, which cannot claim to represent a consensus of modern scholarly opinion.

A. GELSTON

JEREMIAH AND LAMENTATIONS. *R. K. Harrison.* Tyndale Press, 1973. 240 pp. £1 (paperback), £1.35 (hardback).

This, the latest of the Tyndale Old Testament Commentaries, ably meets the standards and specifications of this now familiar Series. With clear and useful comment, and with an excellent historical introduction, R. K. Harrison expounds what he calls a 'theology of disaster'. He is prepared to use Christian illustration, analogy, and application quickly and freely; some pages invite the reader to consult six or seven New Testament texts. This however is not at the expense of fairly detailed textual and exegetical work where necessary (*cf.* e.g. Jer. 23: 33-40 on p. 122). Two additional notes are provided on 'True and False Prophecy' and 'The New Covenant'.

In spite of the acknowledged literary complexities of 'Jeremiah' the author holds most of his literary views with remarkable tenacity. It is not true that those who argue for Deuteronomistic influence never indicate its relevance (p. 30) (*cf.* e.g. E. W. Nicholson—*Preaching to the Exiles*, Blackwell, 1970), and some will wonder what 'high degree of literacy' (p. 31) means for seventh century Judah. This author has a genuine concern for right methodology, but his own method will, in the eyes of many, leave unexplained the internal complexities and peculiarities of Old Testament prophetic literature. Have we genuinely comparable external material, and if so, how is its origin and relevance to be evaluated?

The commentary on Lamentations contains a useful and simple introduction to the patterns of Hebrew poetry. While the anonymity of the Book is recognised, Jeremianic authorship is considered highly probable.

At the price this series continues to be good value for money.

P. J. BUDD

AMOS, HOSEA, MICAH: (THE CAMBRIDGE BIBLE COMMENTARY ON THE NEW ENGLISH BIBLE). *Henry McKeating.* CUP. x + 198 pp. £2.20 hardback.

These three minor prophets have been well worked over by popular commentators and it is not easy to say anything fresh about them. But Dr. McKeating has done a very good job in the space at his disposal, and this book is a model of conciseness and readability. Inevitably much space is taken up by the NEB text, which is essential for a commentary of this kind, and so room for comment is even more restricted. But here is good layman's explanation which reaches down to individual verses and words, some (like Amos 7: 14, Hos. 3: 16f.) dealt with in considerable detail. Despite his commission, the author is not afraid to hint his disagreement with what he considers to be a poor translation in NEB as with the unlikely 'buffaloes' of Amos 5: 22; the weakly Anglican 'to have and to hold' of Hosea 2: 20 and the unhebraic shepherd's crook of Micah 7: 14.

JOHN B. TAYLOR

PRE-CHRISTIAN GNOSTICISM: A SURVEY OF THE PROPOSED EVIDENCE. *Edwin Yamauchi.* Tyndale Press, 1973. 208 pp. £2.25.

While there are better studies on various aspects of Gnosticism, the reviewer

knows of none that covers the scope of this book from the point of view of the question of pre-Christian Gnosticism.

Yamauchi indicates the problems involved in defining Gnosticism. He then deals with the New Testament, Patristic, Hermetic, Iranian, Syriac, Coptic, Mandaic, and Jewish evidence for a pre-Christian Gnosticism, and discusses the question of a pre-Christian Redeemer myth. He concludes with a critique of the methodology of those who argue for the pre-Christian origin of Gnosticism.

Yamauchi rejects the theory of a pre-Christian Gnosticism, with or without Redeemer. He also rejects the theories of Iranian and Jewish origin indicating the probability of Christian influence in the emergence of Gnosticism.

The faulty methodology criticised includes the use of post-Christian sources to prove the existence of pre-Christian Gnosticism; the use of the New Testament, by reading back later Gnostic thought into fragments of language later used by Gnostics, as evidence of pre-Christian Gnosticism; the assertion that parallels prove dependence, and that non-Christian means pre-Christian.

While Quispel is quoted with approval, 'It is becoming increasingly clear that Gnosis in its essential being is *non-Christian*; the view that it is *pre-Christian* must still be proven' (pp. 181f). Yamauchi only wishes to make the point that non-Christian does not prove pre-Christian. He does not accept the non-Christian nature of Gnosticism. It is because the majority of German scholars accept this and take Gnostic mythology seriously that their approach is so different from that of English speaking scholars (p. 176). Of course this does not justify the methodology which is rightly criticised. But this criticism of methodology does not solve the problem of the origin of the Gnostic phenomenon.

The book is not so much a survey of the evidence as a survey of opinions about the evidence. While this is useful it is obvious that the opinions could have been arranged to present a different point of view. Nor do all of the scholars quoted say precisely what Yamauchi wants them to say, e.g. Quispel as above. But one can hardly complain as the alternative of dealing with the primary sources would have put this book out of reach for the general reader.

While not all of the Nag Hammadi treatises have been discussed it is surely strange that the Gospel of Truth is not mentioned at all. But it would be petty to complain about an omission of this sort in a book that offers so much to students of the New Testament. JOHN PAINTER

JESUS'S AUDIENCE: THE SOCIAL AND PSYCHOLOGICAL ENVIRONMENT IN WHICH HE WORKED. *J. Duncan M. Derrett.* Darton, Longman & Todd, 1973. 240 pp. £2.75.

Inter-disciplinary studies are becoming popular, and there is no doubt that a scholar trained in a different expertise will often bring illuminating insights to a subject. Professor Derrett is an academic lawyer, who spent much of his earlier life in India. In this book he attempts to penetrate behind the New Testament to the society in which Jesus lived and taught. He points out that most Biblical scholars have been 'Westerns' and in some sense 'committed' to the Church, and he sets out to correct the perspective by drawing on the insights he has gained from living in an Asian community.

How successful is the attempt? It seems likely that there are here many

detailed insights (in some respects the appendices being the best part of the work) which will permanently enrich the resources of the exegete, though they will need to be evaluated by specialists. But there are grounds for caution. Is there a logical fallacy in the broad categorisation of first-century Palestinian Jews with twentieth-century Indians as 'Asians'? Even if a racial and geographical barrier can to some extent be penetrated by looking to the modern East, the chronological barrier remains, and is not finally surmountable by any amount of research. Again, Professor Derrett is by his own admission 'untaught' in this field. Doubtless this saves him from common misunderstandings and prejudices, but would any professional student of the New Testament cite Matthew 1: 18, 20 as evidence for the view that 'no conception took place without the co-operation of the holy spirit'? (p. 119). Surely the Evangelist meant something more specific. The successful pursuit of interdisciplinary studies requires full qualification in both disciplines.

A. GELSTON

JESUS THE MESSIAH: AN ILLUSTRATED LIFE OF CHRIST. *Donald Guthrie.* Pickering & Inglis. 386 pp. £2.75.

A large book with Donald Guthrie as author and *Jesus the Messiah: An Illustrated Life of Christ* as title gives a thrill of expectation. Donald Guthrie has made himself master of the critical debates concerning the New Testament and his name is a hallmark of scholarship and sound judgment. And the title suggests at once the century-old classic of Alfred Edersheim, *The Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah*. What greater gift could there be to the reading public than a modern equivalent of Edersheim which took into account the scholarship of the past hundred years!

But, alas, this book has no such exalted aim. In 374 pages of fairly large print, and with good black and white illustrations of modern Palestine, its scope is limited. It is intended to be a popular account of the life and teaching of Jesus which relates and comments on the narratives of the four gospels in roughly chronological order. The whole text is about twice the combined length of the gospels, which means (since much of the story is retold in the author's words) that the comment, though judicious, is very thin. The hope of finding the distilled essence of Guthrie's thoughts on Jesus' teaching about life after death brought to light an extreme example of scanty treatment. The subject index, which contains about 500 items, proved to have no entry under heaven, hell, hades, gehenna, life or soul. (One could not help wondering whether this was by chance or whether it was part of an evangelical conspiracy of silence on this delicate subject.)

It is a sound book, which would be read with profit by the serious-minded layman, but it is neither lively enough to be really popular, nor full enough to be an obvious tool for the scholarly. We hope that the author will continue his courageous bouts in the heavyweights division where the hardest ideological battles have to be fought.

JOHN WENHAM

THE FIRST AND SECOND EPISTLES TO THE THESSALONIANS: BLACK'S NEW TESTAMENT COMMENTARIES. *Ernest Best.* A. & C. Black, 1973. 376 pp. Cased £4.00. Paper £2.50.

This is a valuable addition to a notable series now nearing completion. There has long been wanting a really substantial commentary on these

letters (for many, Rigaux's massive work is inaccessible). Dr. Best has admirably filled the gap.

In a detailed introduction, the author pays special attention to the views of Schmithals and of Jewett concerning the opponents at Thessalonica, concluding that both scholars are unwarrantably monist in method. He reaches similarly traditional conclusions regarding the second letter's date (shortly after the first), composition (a unity) and authorship (Pauline), providing us with a most thorough examination of recent scholarship on these questions.

Nearly 300 pages of commentary, including Dr. Best's own translation of the Epistles, form the bulk of the book. Throughout one is aware of being in the hands of a wise, penetrating, balanced guide. Maybe confidence wavers slightly when the theme is eschatology, though here too Dr. Best is cautious (on 1 Thess. 4: 15, for instance, he suggests that Paul's hope that he might live to see the Parousia may always have been balanced by an awareness that he might die prior to it; on *katechôn* in 2 Thess. 2: 7 he offers a very tentative view, preferring, in fact, to remain agnostic). A brief appendix on 'The Parousia' and a three-page chapter on 'Paul and the Thessalonians' might usefully have been incorporated into the commentary. A final essay on 'The return of Christ' is a stimulating attempt to 'look at some of the issues which eschatology raises for us . . .' and one could wish that space had allowed a fuller treatment.

A. L. MOORE

THE ENGLISH REFORMATION 1529-58. *David H. Pill*. University of London Press, 1973. 224 pp. £1.05.

The spate of books on English religious history flows on. From internal evidence this appears to be part of a series called London History Studies. Oddly enough this is not revealed on the cover as it is on the succeeding volume by H. G. Alexander (*Religion in England 1558-1662*). The format of the series is that of a text book based on secondary sources, without references, but containing valuable and up-to-date reading lists.

This volume has a strong grip on recent writing on the period. It is valuable for the novice as it introduces him to differing views on questions in dispute. However it is irritating to have the views of, say, G. R. Elton, dismissed in a book which gives no references. The author on the whole writes well when he is describing the political and religious history of the period, but is weak when he describes the theological changes introduced by the Protestant reformers. His reading lists lack the books of P. E. Hughes and D. B. Knox on the theological side of the English Reformation. It is typical of the author that he describes the *42 Articles* of 1553 as confused in their theology. The interests of the author seem to be revealed by the beginning and ending of the book where most space is given to the state of 'Catholic' practice in the Church of England. While A. G. Dickens' book on the English Reformation remains in print even the novice would do better to secure it. Incidentally it is considerably cheaper.

N. S. POLLARD

THE LIFE, LETTERS AND WRITINGS OF JOHN HOSKYNS 1566-1638. *L. B. Osborn*. Archon. 321 pp. \$10.00.

This is a reprint of a 1937 Yale English literature study. Hoskyns was a minor figure who really stood between the Elizabethan era and the Common-

wealth one. He was a man of many parts: a wit, a lawyer, stylist, literary critic, occasional poet in English and Latin, and a parliamentarian. Ecclesiastically he was anti-Papist but no Puritan, in truth something of a conservative Elizabethan churchman. He is not a front line figure, but then it is the work of the larger number of second line men which helps us to fill a complete historical perspective. This book will therefore fill a small gap in a reference library, and for that we should be grateful to the publisher of this reprint.

G. E. DUFFIELD

CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE: THE COMPLETE PROSE WORKS OF JOHN MILTON. VOL. 6. *Edited by Maurice Kelley. Translated by John Carey.* Yale University Press, 1973. 863 pp. £10.50.

This is the sixth of eight volumes reprinting all Milton's prose with full introductions and notes. The MS of *De Doctrina Christiana*, long thought to be lost, was discovered in Whitehall in 1823. Two years later it was published with an English translation by Charles Richard Sumner, much corrected at the proof stage by the brilliant classicist William Sydney Walker. There have been several editions since, all using the same translation.

So we have here only the second translation of the work ever to be published. A new version is called for on two grounds: style and accuracy. Sumner's long periods, though they reproduce some of the movement of Milton's Latin ones, do not read easily in an uninflected language like English. This new edition puts lucidity first. And the old version was misleading in an important respect: in the course of his treatise Milton quoted over 7,000 proof texts, making his own translations from the Hebrew and Greek as he went along; Sumner replaced them all by quotations from the Authorised Version which often differ substantially from Milton's, thus making nonsense of some of his arguments. For this reason John Carey can claim that 'for considerable portions of the treatise this new translation is not the second English rendering but the first'.

It cannot be said that this work makes an impact comparable with that of Milton's best known English writings. Indeed, many chapters are little more than a catena of Biblical quotations. But it is important for the light it throws on his intellectual background and his beliefs at about the time he was writing *Paradise Lost*. Many generations of readers have enjoyed *Paradise Lost* without suspecting the poet's heterodoxies, except perhaps for an occasional trace of Arianism. The fact is that Milton in his great imaginative work skilfully used the common traditions of Christendom in a way that neither offended his readers nor compromised his own integrity. The *Christian Doctrine* is much more explicit. Basing his arguments primarily on scripture, Milton forcefully supports a number of major heresies—Arianism, Arminianism, certain features of the doctrine of creation, and Mortalism (the belief that the soul perishes with the body until both are resurrected for judgment). He also vigorously defends divorce and Old Testament polygamy (although acknowledging that Solomon 'seems to have exceeded the limit').

Professor Kelley's notes identify sources and analogues from the whole of ancient, medieval and renaissance learning, and he cites many parallels in Milton's poetry. He modestly claims to be offering this edition 'merely as a beginning and an indication of the areas to be covered' in a definitive edition.

Meanwhile it will be indispensable to anyone concerned with the development of Milton's thought and his place in the seventeenth-century scene.

OWEN C. WATKINS

THE LITURGY OF COMPREHENSION 1689: AN ABORTIVE ATTEMPT TO REVISE THE BOOK OF COMMON PRAYER. *Timothy J. Fawcett.* Alcuin Club Collections No. 54. Mayhew-McCrimmon. 287 pp. £4.00.

Dr. Fawcett here provides details of the proposals for altering the Prayer Book in 1689. They formed part of a scheme for the comprehension of Dissenters which offered redress on some points of long-standing grievance with the established order of the Church of England. The scheme failed, partly through the antipathy of some Anglican clergy, but largely because just at this time the Dissenters were granted by Parliament a measure of toleration for their own services, and it may be doubted how far the 1689 Book would have met their case. Details of the proposals were kept secret, for political reasons, until Parliament called for an edition in 1854, which was carried out by W. H. Black.

The present edition supersedes the previous one because it includes not only the proposals and the diary of the Commission's proceedings kept by John Williams, but also recently discovered details of the discussions of 1688 on which the Commission's work was based, and full information about the different alternatives considered in 1689. Dr. G. J. Cuming, in his fine work on the 1662 revision, has already demonstrated the importance of taking into account the various stages of change in committee and in re-drafting. The 1689 episode shows the rise to power of the Latitudinarians and the disruption of parties in the Church caused by the Revolution. Many proposals are interesting in their own liturgical right. Dr. Fawcett has provided valuable notes on such matters as the shortening of the Sunday service and revision of the Collects.

The Alcuin Club's new publishers have succeeded in checking the upward spiral of prices, though at the expense of some quality of production. So complex a critical apparatus has made heavy demands on editor and type-setter. While the texts have been carefully reproduced, there are unfortunately a large number of inaccurate quotations, references and misprints in the introduction and notes. I counted no less than 53 errors on pages 1-46 alone.

JOHN TILLER

CHURCHMEN AND THE CONDITION OF ENGLAND 1832-1885: A STUDY IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF SOCIAL IDEAS AND PRACTICE FROM THE OLD REGIME TO THE MODERN STATE. *G. Kitson Clark.* Methuen, 1973. 353 pp. £4.50.

Anyone who, like the reviewer, has sat at Dr. Kitson Clark's feet will know that, in turning to this book, they can expect to find a wide and discriminating knowledge of Victorian political and social history. His main thesis is that, without pressing the discontinuities too sharply, three phases can be discerned in the nineteenth century: the period before 1832 of the 'old controls' of the agrarian society which was passing; the period between the two Reform Bills (1832-1865) when *laissez-faire* and local initiative characterised social policy; and the period after 1865 of 'incipient collectivism'. If this sounds daunting, it is not. Within this framework he explores the responses of churchmen to the evolving social order with many illuminating examples,

both eminent and relatively unknown. This makes the book an important contribution to our understanding of the social involvement of the clergy in society (for example, they ceased in any number to be justices after 1875, though many had served before then) and, further, of the Church's relation to the State. As he shows in the final chapter, the study has great relevance to our present situation in a state which has continued with the collectivist momentum of his final phase, without a clear moral philosophy to guide it, and with diminishing respect for the right to dissent. Demographic considerations had forced upon the Victorian machinery of State post-1865 such familiar compulsory provisions as elementary education.

Evangelicalism is wrongly spelt (p. 49). The Greek characters for *politeia* are wrongly rendered (p. 145). T. E. YATES

THE MISSIONARIES. *Geoffrey Moorhouse.* Eyre Methuen, 1973. 368 pp. £3.95.

For an expert to read a book on his own subject written by an amiable amateur is always an interesting and sometimes an entertaining task. This is exactly what Mr. Moorhouse is. Like some more serious historians, he has realised that what we call the third world is, especially in Africa, largely the creation of the immense Christian missionary enterprise of the nineteenth century, and has seen that there is a good story to be told. On the whole this is a friendly and agreeable book. Mr. Moorhouse is almost, though not quite, uncontaminated by the contemporary anti-missionary myth, that everything in Africa was almost perfect until the missionaries came along and spoiled it all.

The method, wisely, is mainly biographical and episodic. Using well-known sources, Mr. Moorhouse has depicted for us such notable figures as Robert Moffat, Livingstone, Anna Hinderer, Mary Slessor, rather thinly Cardinal Lavigerie, and less successfully the great Bishop Tucker of Uganda. He does not conceal the uncertainties, the follies and at times even the crimes, of missionaries. But by their essential goodness, their tenacity, their real concern for the welfare of the African, the sheer creative magnificence of their achievement, they win his heart and his admiration. In all this there is little that will be new to the student of the subject; but the value of the book is precisely that it is likely to be read by a great many people who would not look at a book written by a missionary or a professional; and such readers will learn a great deal from it.

The work is not without its faults. At some points Mr. Moorhouse has just been careless. An entirely unnecessary footnote on p. 35 tells us that Cape Coast is modern Accra; when I asked my brother who has spent many years in Ghana whether this could possibly be so, I was greeted by loud laughter; in 1873 Cape Coast was 120 miles west of Accra; in 1973 it is still 120 miles west of Accra. Mr. Moorhouse boldly rushes into thorny ground where I would hesitate to set foot. What did Lugard actually do at the 'battle of Mengo'? What were the real facts about the later years of Bishop Crowther? (Mr. Moorhouse does not make the obvious point that, if only the CMS had had the sense to pension the Bishop off when he reached the age of 70, or at least to ask him to restrict his activities to the Yoruba country, where he was really at home, all the miseries of his last ten years could have been avoided.) The most serious weakness, however, lies elsewhere. Mr. Moorhouse complains that the missionaries took too little trouble to under-

stand the Africans. He himself has made no serious effort to understand the missionaries. What is this strange obsessive conviction that it is essential to human existence that all men should be brought to the knowledge of Christ, and that, the better the man is in himself, the more important it is that he should be incorporated into Christ who is the head of every man? Mr. Moorhouse might reply that this is a theological matter and no business of his as a journalist. But, if a writer undertakes to deal with what is essentially a theological subject, he may not excuse himself from doing the necessary theological homework. The result of this neglect is that the book is in the exact sense of the term superficial; it deals with missionary work from the outside, looking only at the surface; it almost wholly misses the inner reality.

Nevertheless, allowing for these limitations, the book is a good book, and I hope that it may find a multitude of readers. STEPHEN NEILL

CHRISTIANS IN PERSIA. *Robin E. Waterfield.* Allen & Unwin, 1973. 192 pp. £3.50.

A myth lingers in the West that Middle East countries like Iran were virtually without Christian witness for centuries until the missionary expansion after 1800. Mr. Waterfield does considerable service in showing that Persian Christianity is an unbroken, if often thin, thread through her history since at least A.D. 150.

He has gathered the facts into a handy volume which outlines the story from the early Christian centre of Edessa until the present indigenously led church which has strong links with the West and with its remote past, and is a small but vigorous part of the life of modern Iran. Mr. Waterfield modestly suggests that his book will not please either scholar or general reader. In a sense this is true, in that the scholar will burrow into the dusty tomes which Mr. Waterfield guts for his brief descriptions; and the general reader must not expect a popular style.

Yet the writing becomes extremely moving when he reaches Henry Martyn and the extraordinary impression of sanctity, simplicity and joy which he left behind in his short time in Persia; to say nothing of his famous translation of the Scriptures.

The story of the Faith in Persia includes persecution; its effect on the life of the church was partly noble and partly base. Confessors and martyrs mingle with time-servers and squabblers. It includes, too, the glorious record of missionary expansion which took Nestorian Christians right across to China, founders of a Church which flourished a long time. And it includes the rather sad attempts of Westerners, both Roman and Protestant, to force into their own moulds the remnants of Persia's historic Christian communities. JOHN POLLOCK

THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND, THE METHODISTS AND SOCIETY 1700-1850. *Anthony Armstrong.* University of London Press, 1973. 224 pp. £1.05.

This book deserves a warm welcome. The wide period covered (Tillotson to the Oxford Movement) avoids the usual hiatus at the end of the eighteenth century. This is important not least in the history of Methodism: we can trace not only the growing tensions in Wesley's mind over his relationship with the Church of England (his brother Charles and Grimshaw stemming

the tide over allowing itinerant preachers to administer Communion in 1755) and the growing demand for separation among his followers, but also the inevitable resolution of these tensions when Wesley's autocratic control was removed by his death and modern Methodism emerged in the nineteenth century.

Mr. Armstrong favours the more generous attitude to the eighteenth century Church. Different responses to industrial urbanisation are traced, Methodism gaining ground more quickly but the long-term advantages lying elsewhere. We are faced with the questions Evangelicals were asking in the 1780's: Wesley was 'in part an inspiration, and in part a warning... Ecclesiastically they were not the same. The Evangelicals were bent on making the old system work'. There is a balanced and appreciative account of the Clapham Sect, avoiding hagiography on the one hand and the sweet cynicism of F. K. Brown's important *Fathers of the Victorians* on the other. Surely Wilberforce deserves another biographer.

It was the radical challenges of the hour which found all parties wanting. After the reaction caused by the French Revolutionary Wars, the Church found itself under attack for its wealth and privilege. Mr. Armstrong believes that the Oxford Movement was 'the Church's most curious defence', and with men like Arnold and Maurice in a minority 'the Church never formulated a social programme more profound than church building'. Shaftesbury's opinions and activities were strictly personal.

The work is an introduction to the period only, but is abreast of the latest literature, has very useful date charts and bibliographies, and represents very good value.

JOHN BRIGGS

KIERKEGAARD: A BIOGRAPHICAL INTRODUCTION. *Ronald Grimsley.* Studio Vista Publishers, 1973. 127 pp. £0.95.

Professor Grimsley heads the French Department at Bristol University and his previous publications reflect his especial interest in existential philosophy. Grimsley concludes this book with the observation that 'the impact of Kierkegaard's work does not depend solely upon its philosophical or religious content, important though that is, but on the pervasive intimate connection between his ideas and his own sense of personal involvement in the subject matter of his thought' (p. 114). In attempting to explore this 'intimate connection' any biographer of Kierkegaard must tread a cautious path between explaining away his work in terms of his biography or expounding his thought as if in a vacuum. Given the complexity of such a task and the limited space at his disposal, Professor Grimsley has produced an admirable little book. Apart from a rather uncharacteristic endorsement of Dr. Carl Saggau's speculative theories concerning Kierkegaard's sexual aberrations, the author shows just the right amount of circumspection in relating Kierkegaard's life to his literary output.

The layout of the book revolves around individual chapters each devoted to important Kierkegaardian themes, i.e. dread, existence and despair. Other chapters have a somewhat stronger biographical content. Professor Grimsley proves himself an able expositor of Kierkegaard's works, and his treatment of *The Concept of Irony* and *Concluding Unscientific Postscript* is especially useful. However, the obtuseness of certain works is unfortunately reflected in Professor Grimsley's exposition at some points. The non-philosophically trained reader (for whom this series is primarily intended)

may find himself struggling at these points. As for the main presuppositions of Professor Grimsley's approach, he shows a healthy recognition of the unity of Kierkegaard's authorship, pays due regard to Kierkegaard as essentially a Christian philosopher and demonstrates a wide acquaintance with Kierkegaardian criticism in several languages. Perhaps more could have been said about Kierkegaard's emphasis on the need for the established Church to make an admission of failure in the face of the New Testament demands. This emphasis is especially important as we try to understand the last years. Also, the final chapter dealing with the subsequent use of Kierkegaard's thought might well have been longer. But in spite of these criticisms, the book must rank high in the list of short introductions to the life and work of this remarkable man.

JOHN C. SAXBEE

ENCOUNTERING DARKNESS. *G. A. French-Beytagh*. Collins, 1973. 283 pp. £2.50.

The Dean of Johannesburg was in the news, and in the prayers and conscience of the Church, during his trial under the Terrorism Act in 1971. In this moving book he writes of his remarkable childhood, wandering young manhood, and vocation to the priesthood, includes a personal account of the trial and acquittal, totally free from rancour, and prints his prison diary. Each strand is important; the trial cannot be understood apart from the person, nor the person except against the background—politics, legislation and customary South African 'way of life'.

A slow starter on the anti-apartheid scene, his subsequent performance is the more impressive. His first public political action was for white refugees from black violence in the Belgian Congo. The story of personal development, priestly ministry and humanitarian service is a gripping one, to be read with the same compassion for all human beings caught in the drama, with which it is written—Afrikaner, 'English', black, 'liberal'. There are moments of sheer delight e.g., the New Zealander's comment on the name 'Aubie', and the vision of (the then Bishop) Geoffrey Clayton being told to stuff a parish up his jersey.

Though his ultimate discharge appears to bring ridicule to the prosecution's case, the value for the internal market of the judicial smear remains. But there is another backwash of guilt by association—if apartheid needs such support as interrogation, banning, house arrest, displacement, job reservation, family break-up, the 'darkness' of the title is starkly displayed. Those with minds made up will find plenty to confirm their prior commitment either way. Those so far undecided will find this an essential piece of reporting on a complex situation, provided they recall that this is the tip of an iceberg. Others remain in prison and are unsung; violence, advocated or not, is already there.

PETER R. AKEHURST

DEATH IN THE SECULAR CITY: A STUDY OF THE NOTION OF LIFE AFTER DEATH IN CONTEMPORARY THEOLOGY AND PHILOSOPHY. *Russell Aldwinckle*. George Allen & Unwin, 1973. 194 pp. £5.00 (hard-cover), £2.75 (paper).

This book is a positive and intelligent contribution to the on-going Christian discussion of life after death. The author is Professor of Systematic Theology at McMaster University, Canada, and on the Faith and Order Commission of the World Council of Churches. He argues that neglect of the destiny of the individual beyond death is a profound weakness of much contemporary

Christian life, particularly in the West, and may undermine the stamina and patience of Christians and others in the fulfilling of their social obligations in this life (pp. 18f., 172ff.).

As Professor H. D. Lewis comments in his Foreword, the author brings to the book 'his own philosophical expertise as well as a deep and reflective Christian commitment'.

He vigorously criticises Professor Gordon Kaufman's denial of the hope of life after death in his *Systematic Theology* (New York, 1968). He has extended discussion of Jesus' view of the future life, the Resurrection and the empty tomb, the meaning of time, the intermediate state between death and the Last Judgment, Hell, Judgment and Heaven. He lends some support to Conditional Immortality. He considers that Universalism is legitimate as a hope, but not as a dogma. He doubts if unending retributive punishment in Hell can be justified. He does not think that man's ultimate destiny is decided until the Last Judgment (i.e. it is not decided at death). But for him there is a *Last Judgment*.

His discussion of the alternatives to the traditional Christian hope is very balanced and sensible, as is also his caution about supporting violence as a means for effecting change in this world. ALAN M. FAIRHURST

ETHICS WITHOUT GOD. *Kai Nielsen*. Pemberton, 1973. 103 pp. £1.40. THE HUMANIST OUTLOOK. *Edited by A. J. Ayer*. Pemberton, 1973. 296 pp. £0.75.

Kai Nielsen's concise restatement of the case for ethical autonomy would be a helpful introduction for the newcomer to the debate about theological ethics. His case is the modest one that secular ethics are possible, though he would plainly be sympathetic to the stronger claim that they are necessary. The first chapter deals with the logical status of the claim, 'Goodness is what God wills': it cannot be analytic, and must presuppose a decision that nothing is to count as God which does not will good. In the second chapter the Christian contention that certain facts of human nature demand a theistic morality is rejected. By denying the 'facts' the humanist is committed only to adjusting, not to abandoning, morality. Any principle that may be thought fundamental to morality, so argues the third chapter, may be subscribed to as reasonably by the humanist as by the theist. The fourth chapter, a defence of consequentialism, is an unexpected conclusion. Its assumption, that Christians must deny consequentialism and humanists must assert it, seems false in both respects.

Nielsen is lucid and balanced, and only occasionally loses his patience with his Christian opponents. But it is a pity that the notion of authority appears on page three only to disappear for ever. For the best understanding of the theistic claim is as a proposal for ethical authority. The goodness of God's will is not *à priori*, but accepted on trust of eschatological verification. As Emily Dickenson says, 'I shall know why when time is over.' Like other ethical autonomists Nielsen regards such a position as morally irresponsible, but in this he is insensitive to the epistemological difficulties which are a part of our moral experience. 'Whom shall I follow?' is a question much more often heard than 'What principle shall I subscribe to?', and it is every bit as much a moral question.

The secular humanist essays collected by A. J. Ayer are intended more to hearten the faithful than to engage in serious debate with Christians. They

are uneven, sometimes embarrassingly jejune, too prone to relapse into old-time Christian-bashing. Contributions from Flew, Eysenk and Popper stand out for their seriousness; but one is not left with the impression that these humanists have many definite convictions in common, or that humanism is still a potent intellectual force.

O. M. T. O'DONOVAN

THE ETHICS OF KARL BARTH. *R. E. Willis*. E. J. Brill, 1972. 456 pp. 68 guilders.

For many years Anglo-Saxon theologians were unable to conceive that a theology of grace such as Karl Barth's could consistently contain or result in a substantial ethics. It is now evident, however, that a theology of grace can and does and must, if it is to be a genuine theology of grace, cohere with a developed, informed, and relevant ethics. Some may prefer to base ethics on 'non-gracious' law, natural or revealed, but at least it cannot be said that Barth's is a non-ethical theology.

Because the doubts and misunderstandings remain, however, it is valuable to have a book like this dissertation at San Francisco Theological Seminary directing our attention to the matter. It has a fourfold objective: to elucidate Barth's ethical thought; to discuss the problems that seem to arise; to consider theological objections to this ethics; and to show possible directions in which ethics might move 'beyond' Barth.

This is a big subject, and it receives broad and far from easy treatment. (The difficulty is caused less by Barth than by the style of the author, who will rarely use a concrete monosyllable where he can think of an abstract polysyllable.) To attempt to summarise its argument and assess the whole in a short review would be unfair. May we therefore make three points?

First, Dr. Willis knows how important in understanding Barth is a sound method. It is no use, he tells us, to go only to the directly ethical writings, for in Barth 'dogmatics in its entirety, properly understood, is "directly ethical"' (p. 4). Thus he sees the *Church Dogmatics* 'as one long, sustained ethical treatise' (p. 4). But this leads to the basic consideration that, since theology concerns God's self-revelation in Jesus Christ, ethics has this same Christological foundation. It is an integral part of theology and not another, even if related, discipline. The right understanding and the right treatment of ethics arises from the knowledge of God's self-revelation in Christ—or to say the same thing in another way, from the understanding that the one God exists in his threefold form (see pp. 114ff.).

Secondly, by starting with the earliest writings of Barth, Dr. Willis is able to show that his theology is from the first 'ethically motivated'. This is apparent not only in his Christian Socialism, theoretical and practical, nor only in his horror at the German professor's support of the Kaiser, but also in his preoccupation with the central themes of righteousness and the kingdom of God. To his new views Barth was not pressed by 'religious' considerations but by ethical and social. This is a valuable historical point, even if the distinction should not be forced too far.

Thirdly, the final section of the book seems the least convincing. Dr. Willis' avowed aim here is to indicate some directions in which theology may move beyond Barth in this sphere. But, inasmuch as he begins (pp. 428ff.) with a severe criticism, amounting to a rejection, of Barth's Christological and analogical method, it would appear that 'beyond' is not the correct word, implying as it does that the movement is *through* Barth's ethics and

then on beyond him. For take away Barth's method and you take away what is distinctive and significant in his theology. Dr. Willis therefore seems to want to by-pass Barth, having got back on to the road of nineteenth century theology across which he erected such a strong barrier. 'Many of the concerns that have been indicated were also problems in nineteenth century theology. The movement of theology beyond Barth, then, might well take a turn back to that context. To be sure, it will not be a matter simply of looking at what was done in nineteenth century theology for answers to these issues. It could mean, however, that theology will find itself needing to go back and pick up some of the threads left hanging there, and pull them forward into a new theological fabric' (p. 448). But where does Barth come in in this exercise?

T. H. L. PARKER

ROUSSEAU: AN INTRODUCTION TO HIS POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY. *John C. Hall*. MacMillan. 167 pp. £2.00.

This is Mr. Hall's first book and the fifth in the series *Philosophers in Perspective*, which is edited by Professor Woozley from the University of Virginia. The book is very tightly argued, but Mr. Hall has achieved a lucidity throughout, and at the same time given a valuable treatment of an enormous subject in a very small compass. Rousseau is one of the giants in literature and the history of ideas. His thought and activity was varied and multifaceted, and his influence in a variety of fields is still felt powerfully.

The book proceeds in terms of a strict development of the ideas under consideration. There is an introductory chapter on the life and background of the subject, and then follow chapters on natural man and the theory of existing society. The fourth chapter breaks off to consider the question of literary sources for the *Social Contract*, as a preliminary to an exposition of the substance of the matter, taking in turn the General Will, the Social Contract, Law and the Legislator and Compromise.

The idea that Rousseau may be regarded as a preacher of totalitarianism, which has been put forward notably by J. L. Talmon, is here rejected, and the social contract is seen as a complication of the theory of the general will; this complication being due to Rousseau's view that the general will must have sanctions if it is to be effective in practice.

The exposition of Rousseau's thought is taken entirely from the *Discourse on the Origin of Inequality*, the article on Political Economy in the *Encyclopedie* and the *Social Contract*. In the exposition, especially of the idea of the general will, Mr. Hall takes the material which is closest to the period when Rousseau was particularly concerned with that, that is the late 1750's. Thus he uses basically the Geneva MS of the *Social Contract*, whose history he discusses at length, with some consideration of the *Encyclopedie* article, and the final revised text of the *Social Contract* is used only sparingly.

There is valuable treatment of the relationship between Rousseau and Locke, and the general will of Rousseau is distinguished from the idea of man's natural sociability in Aristotle, Grotius and others, the formal resolutions of democratic assemblies, the greatest happiness principle of the utilitarians, and Kant's universal law. All this is helpful, as is the last chapter on some modern applications. There is an appendix containing a note on Representation an annotated select bibliography and an index.

B. N. KAYE

THE CHURCH AND THE GIFTS OF THE SPIRIT. *John Goldingay*. Grove Books, 1972. 24 pp. £0.20. HOLY SPIRIT BAPTISM. *A. A. Hoekema*. Paternoster, 1972. 101 pp. £0.60. GATHERED FOR POWER. *W. Graham Pulkingham*. Hodder, 1973. 138 pp. £1.60. CAN THE PENTECOSTAL MOVEMENT RENEW THE CHURCHES? *Emmanuel Sullivan, S.A.* British Council of Churches, 1973. £0.12. DID YOU RECEIVE THE SPIRIT? *Simon Tugwell, O.P.* Darton, Longman & Todd, 1972. 143 pp. £1.70. NEW TESTAMENT TEACHING ON TONGUES *Merrill F. Unger*. Kregel, 1972. \$1.75. SPIRITUAL GIFTS IN THE APOSTOLIC CHURCH. *Rowland S. Ward*. Rowland S. Ward, 1972. 62 pp. £0.25.

A caller at a Christian bookshop asked for something on the Pentecostal Movement. 'Yes, Sir,' was the answer, 'Do you want something pro- or anti-?' Of the above Hoekema, Unger and Ward are basically anti-; Pulkingham and Tugwell are basically pro-, while Goldingay and Sullivan are neutral. Several writers make the point that Pentecostals base their assertions largely on their experience, while non-Pentecostals confine their answers largely to exegesis, so that the two sides never really come to grips. In fact this is an over-simplification. One of the thrusts behind non-Pentecostal writers undoubtedly is their experience, namely that they have *not* experienced Pentecostal manifestations, and indeed may have experienced a conviction that they should not expect to do so; an agonising uncertainty about this drives them to search the Scriptures. Likewise behind Pentecostal writers is a desire that their brethren should come to see in the Scriptures new truths.

Pulkingham's book is yet another Pentecostal success story. At Redeemer Church, Houston, where he is Rector, there has been 'outstanding success' over 'a six-year period beginning in January 1966'. Michael Harper in a foreword tells us that there are 'principles here which are applicable in many situations'. What these principles are, however, does not appear, as for some unexplained reason the story is only taken up to the early months of 1966, and the novelette-ish style of writing does not make them easy to discern. Perhaps the sequel which is promised will make these things clearer, but it seems strange the whole was not put into one volume.

The pamphlet by John Goldingay is sub-titled as 'A practical exposition of 1 Corinthians 12-14', and had its origin in a series of expositions given at St. John's College, Nottingham. A lively spoken style is still apparent, but the pamphlet will in fact repay careful reading. Taking as it does some of the key chapters for study on this subject, the pamphlet is judicious and impartial, well documented and shrewdly applied to the present day situation. It provides the sort of careful background study that is necessary as a prelude to the forming of opinions.

Rowland S. Ward attempts something similar in his volume, which is a good deal more exhaustive, not to say exhausting. It is written firmly from a classic Reformed position and follows B. B. Warfield on the cessation of spiritual gifts. No side issue is left unexplored; we learn for instance the importance of singing psalms only and not hymns. The effect of this is to make the book hard to read and the thread is often lost. But those with strength to persevere will find much solid and sound teaching.

The books by A. A. Hoekema and Merrill F. Unger will provide useful

material for the non-Pentecostal to bolster and clarify his opinions, but they are unlikely to do much to persuade the Pentecostal. The ground is by now well-worn and the treatment here too brief. It is also a pity to single out, as Unger does, the issue of tongues. A key text to which little attention is given and which one would like to see more fully expounded is John 7: 39. W. Milligan had a chapter on this in *The Ascension and Heavenly Priesthood of Our Lord* (London, 1892).

If the Pentecostal Movement is anything it is the power of the living Holy Spirit being re-discovered in the lives of individuals and Churches. One thing it will not be is a useful device with which ecclesiastical bureaucrats may stir up the ecumenical movement, rather as a desperate Chancellor might reach for VAT or SET. The BCC pamphlet hardly seems to get beyond so regarding it, and therefore the answer to its question must be a firm 'No'. The questions posed by the Pentecostal Movement must be answered with a far greater degree of personal involvement.

The most interesting of the books under review is Simon Tugwell's 'Did you receive the Spirit?' He is a Catholic Pentecostal and the book ranges a good deal more widely than narrowly Pentecostal issues, opening with a study of the value of Prayer Meetings, apparently of the type familiar to Evangelicals. He also has to justify Pentecostal ideas to his co-religionists who might regard them as 'not catholic'; we learn for instance that all sorts of unexpected Roman Catholics of former days in fact spoke in tongues. But the author is free from many moulds that influence Evangelical thinking, so his judgment is fresh and significant. He rejects the Pentecostal view of the baptism in the Holy Spirit, and suggests that sometimes the language may be quite misleading. 'People can pray for a "baptism in the Spirit" . . . and nothing will ever happen, because their prayer means nothing. They are not really asking for anything. . . . They take refuge in grandiose talk . . . successfully evading the real issue to which the Lord is trying to bring them.' There is material here for both the pro-s and the anti-s to ponder.

J. K. SPENCE

CHRIST AND THE YOUNGER CHURCHES: THEOLOGICAL CONTRIBUTIONS FROM ASIA, AFRICA AND LATIN AMERICA. SPCK. 112 pp. £1.40.

This is a collection in the SPCK 'Theological Collections' series of seven essays by members of the younger churches. Four of them relate to India and East Asia, two to Africa and one to Latin America; the Muslim World is not represented. For me this was a disappointing book. I looked almost in vain for new insights into Christian truth viewed from a totally different background from that to which we are accustomed and for new facets of the beauty and glory of Christ. Instead I found somewhat dry and scholastic discussions of God's action in history, of the Trinity and the Incarnation seen in terms of Hindu categories expressed in long Sanskrit words and of the divine wrath in contrast to the Buddhist ideal of impassivity. Kitamori's essay on 'the problem of pain in Christology' could as well have been written by a Westerner. But interesting questions about Christianity and society are raised by Adegbola's 'Christian interpretation of the African revolution' — 'a changed society is the triumph of the power and grace of God'. Choan-Seng Song grapples with the conflict between the Hindu conviction that 'the essential truth of all religions is the same' and the uniqueness of the person

and work of Christ, and also with that between the ethical approach of the Chinese and the 'soteriology without which Christianity is empty'. But for me the most interesting essay was John Mbiti's on 'some African concepts of Christology', in which he draws on the living experience of African churches, including some of the independent churches whose importance is just beginning to be realised outside Africa. He finds the concepts of Lord, Son of God and Servant of the Lord in harmony with traditional concepts, but supremely the idea of Christ as victor over sorcery, spirits, fear and all the powers of evil fills a great vacuum in African thinking and experience. 'The concept of Jesus as Saviour strikes the African world with dynamic meaning. . . . It is as if they awaited in darkness not knowing that a Saviour would come.' Here is something which carries meaning and hope the world over; the book was worth reading for the sake of this one essay.

R. W. F. WOOTTON

THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND IN CRISIS. *Trevor Beeson.* Davis-Poynter, 1973. 194 pp. £2.50 hardback, £1.50 paperback.

Trevor Beeson has given us a useful description of the Church of England, as at present organised, in appropriately unflattering terms. He takes as his starting-point the rejection of the recent Anglican-Methodist unity scheme and finds this event confirmation of the strength of partisan and conservative elements in the Church.

Middle-class leadership and shrinking membership are discussed, and Trevor Beeson finds the rejection of the Leslie Paul/Fenton Morley proposals another decisive refusal of the Church of England to set its own house in order.

The General Synod is little more than the Church Assembly with another name; the Church Commissioners control almost as much of the Church's money as the General Synod but are not accountable in Synod for its expenditure. As far as the Church-State connection is concerned, the author gossips interestingly about recent episcopal appointments but concludes that an overhaul of the Establishment is no more likely to be of any substantial benefit than the revision of Canon Law; he concludes that church leaders should 'shed the trappings and pomp which go with a privileged position in society' without waiting for any major overhaul of the relationship.

In short, Trevor Beeson finds, what every observer is bound to find, that the Church of England is a complex institution of questionable efficiency which is apparently designed to resist change. The inevitable consequence is an increase in the number of those, both lay and ordained, 'who, while keeping one foot firmly inside the institutional church, find their main work and fulfilment outside it'.

Trevor Beeson suggests new episcopal 'middle-management' in the Church with a bishop for every thirty parishes and a determined effort to improve the quality of ordained leadership. His suggestions for solving our problems are modest and scarcely original, but they are sensible and could well command some support. The difficulty, as he himself acknowledges, is that many men feel that they have not the time to wait for signs that the Church of England is even beginning to put itself straight. In this area the refusal of the Church of England to go forward with some sensible reorganisation of the deployment of the clergy is, in my view, extremely serious. Men—even clergymen—must have confidence in the management, and the present

haphazard distribution and appointment of the clergy is a weighty factor in any attempt to account for the low morale of the parochial clergy today.

As far as Evangelicals are concerned, Trevor Beeson is a little less than fully sympathetic, but for this we must assume that we Evangelicals are ourselves to blame. Perhaps Mr. Beeson has never found us to be very interesting people.

JOHN C. KING

CHURCH, PROPERTY AND PEOPLE: THE RESULTS OF A SURVEY IN BRADFORD, DERBY AND LAMBETH—THREE MULTI-RACIAL, MULTI-FAITH AREAS. *Ann Holmes*. British Council of Churches, 1973. 57 pp. £0.50.

'Churches own property far in excess of their needs, whilst the burden of maintaining this property is draining away resources of time and money. There is a need for radical re-thinking on the part of the Churches about mission in urban-industrial areas, and especially about the role played by buildings in this mission.'

These are some of the conclusions reached by Ann Holmes after a survey of the way in which Church property is used in three varying industrial areas. Her findings indicate that by and large the churches are seeking to use their property as fully as possible, although different views exist within their ranks as to how this should be done. These divergent views are brought into sharpest focus over the question of the use of Church property by non-Christian religious and social groups, especially when such property becomes redundant. In such circumstances can the Church in good conscience maintain exclusive attitudes towards these buildings, when other organisations, such as the Muslims, may have no other property available to them?

Mrs. Holmes admits that her report is not an end in itself, but is part of the continuing debate on church property in multi-racial areas. Accordingly she seeks to highlight other areas of this debate. These include the meaning of such words as 'consecration', 'sacred', 'non-Christian', the extent to which questions of fabric and economics should be allowed to determine policy on mission, and how far exclusive theological attitudes should be tempered by openness and charity. Above all, the question we should ask is not 'What should we do with our buildings?', but 'What is our role as the Church, and do buildings help or hinder the fulfilment of this role?'

In presenting concisely and clearly important questions such as these, Mrs. Holmes has given a useful lead to anyone following the wider debate.

R. CASSIDY

A HANDBOOK OF PARISH PROPERTY. *Kenneth J. T. Elphinstone*. Mowbrays, 1973. 132 pp. £0.90.

It is a commonplace going back at least 300 years that Christianity is part of the Common Law of England. Certainly the affairs of the Church of England, and of the English parish, are inextricably woven into our legal fabric. This handbook, hiding beneath the modest exterior of yet another paperback a wealth of information, offers a sure and well-ordered guide through the complexities of the law (which does not, of course, stand still) on matters such as church buildings and churchyards, faculties, parish trusts and finances, and parochial schemes or orders under the Pastoral Measure. The Dean of the Arches, in a brief Foreword, describes the author as 'particularly well qualified . . . to give guidance to those who are baffled' and as

'the kind of Chancellor . . . who always helps and never hinders'. All who have to do with parish property will value this compendium, and will wonder how we managed when we had to scratch about in many books, papers, measures and memoranda to seek for answers which are here set forth, carefully indexed, with clarity and with authority.

TIMOTHY DUDLEY-SMITH

THE UNIVERSITY AT WORK. *Derman Christopherson.* SCM Press. 233 pp. £3.00.

This book is a sequel to Sir Walter Moberly's *Crisis in the University*, published twenty-four years ago by the same Press. That book arose from the discussions between members of 'The University Teachers' Group', a group of Christian dons looking at the problems of university life after the war, when so many universities, in Germany particularly, had proved too vulnerable to state pressure.

The group has continued, still made up mostly of Christians, though with a rather less articulate commitment. The author is Sir Derman Christopherson, Vice-Chancellor of Durham, and himself an openly professed Christian. As a former head of a college at Durham myself, bred university-wise at Cambridge, and now bishop of a See-city with a modern university in its midst, I read the book with close personal interest. I could visualise so many of the situations therein envisaged.

Any who knew Sir Derman will know what to expect—a book based on a vast personal experience, cool and calm judgment, and a Christian profession which is kept under such strict control that in the book it is only just visible, except by implication.

What we have here is a description of university life in Britain (chiefly England) today, a picture where every possible piece of evidence is produced to show that universities still do their traditional work, and where great changes are taking place, particularly in matters such as student participation. The author has lived long enough between two fires to be anxious to do justice to whatever rival claims may be asserted for each side.

The book will not please either die-hard academic conservatives or wild radicals. It always chooses the middle way. It is the sort of book which irritates many, because the author speaks with a quiet assurance based on indubitable experience. His one rash 'venture' is an ambivalent chapter at the end called 'An Appreciation of Revolution', in which Christopherson puts up the best case he can for the 'scrap all precedent' school of thought, only to show how very flimsy are the foundations for such an anarchic policy.

Readers of *The Churchman* will be disappointed not to find more interest in the explicit Christian cause in universities. Neither Chaplaincies, IVF work, or the SCM come in for more than a brief mention, if that. Only because Christianity has a doctrine of Original Sin does the author directly adduce Christian insight! But the insights are there, though only to be recognised by their fruits. The author could claim good authority for taking that line.

RONALD LEICESTER

FAITH AND THE FAITH. *R. R. Williams.* Mowbray, 1973. 134 pp. £0.90.

The Bishop of Leicester, at the request of his clergy for a special exercise of his teaching ministry, has given an exposition of faith and the faith as straight-

forward as the title suggests. His scholarship ensures accuracy of statement and clarity of thought, but what we recognise primarily is the shepherd feeding his flock. More than once he reminds us that he has been ordained for over forty years, but his experience and maturity are brought to bear on the situations of today and tomorrow. What emerges is an up-to-date testimony to the truth and power of the gospel.

The book is in two parts. The first has chapter headings which are alliterative—The Meaning, Making, Maturing and Maintenance of the Faith—reminiscent perhaps of the preachers of earlier days! The second four chapters are about The Faith—what Christians believe and, as a result, commit themselves to. The Bishop recalls a sermon on St. Paul's shipwreck in which the Christian Faith was likened to a battered ship, but with enough planks and broken pieces to provide safe transport if only we would cling to what we could see and put our trust in that. He says: 'I have remembered the sermon for more than forty years, but I confess that the picture of the faith it presented—a mass of broken timber—was not one to evoke much trust and confidence.' The picture he himself offers is of our Faith as a coherent whole, a well-integrated pattern, capable of sustaining all men, in all ages, and at all times. In a chapter on the variety of ways in which people are brought to faith, Dr. Williams mentions 'the reading of some striking book'. His own latest book may help people to the same happy result. MARTIN PARSONS

THE CHRISTIAN PRIEST TODAY. *Michael Ramsey.* SPCK, 1972. 100 pp. £0.80.

Based upon a series of ordination charges this little book offers fresh insights into the function and resources of the Christian ministry. It is concerned with the unchanging aspect of the minister's life and work, though it is everywhere related to a changing society.

The Archbishop's essential point, made in the first charge, is the representative character of the ministry, gathering up in itself the different roles which belong to the whole Church. He expands this in an excellent third chapter, perhaps the best in the book, on 'The Man of Prayer'. He has two good chapters on 'Preaching God Today' and 'Preaching Jesus Today'. In the former he has good things to say about the preaching of God in judgment. In neither chapter does he make any concessions to the squeamishness of some modern theology, yet succeeds in unveiling a God who is truly contemporary.

Almost every chapter, indeed every page, has something useful to offer. He speaks of the generation gap in the ministry and the problems which it presents for understanding and fellowship. 'Pierce down deep . . .', he writes, 'and you discover what is neither modern and contemporary or old and archaic, but genuinely timeless.' 'The true radical is not the man who suspends himself from the branches on either the left or the right, but the man who in his thinking and action goes to the root of the tree.'

This is a book to read and ponder and, for anyone in the ministry or preparing for it, worth several heavy tomes. W. N. READ

PASTORAL CARE AND PASTORAL THEOLOGY. *Ian F. McIntosh.* St. Andrew Press. 160 pp. £1.25.

This is more than anything an essay in self-analysis. The author is a Church of Scotland minister, who has had some specialisation in Pastoral Theology at a Presbyterian Seminary in the USA.

He takes the case of a particular family, with which he was brought into touch while working as a hospital chaplain and records in some detail his pastoral conversations with husband and wife over a period of some six months. He offers theological and pastoral reflections upon the changing situation.

He is suitably self-critical of his own counselling performance, adhering strictly to a non-directional approach. But the crux of the book lies in the validity of using this single case to establish a pastoral theology, however limited, and a pastoral method. It would seem to your reviewer that, helpful as the reflections may have been for the one who made them and who was directly involved, they are neither sufficiently vivid nor sufficiently clear to benefit the ordinary reader.

There is, inevitably, a great deal of clinical theological jargon, but for one, at any rate, the comments fail to clarify. One knows little more about the real tensions at the end than at the beginning and the indeterminate nature of the evidence scarcely encourages one to expect a valid conclusion. The author asserts that the pastoral situation dictates the analysis and discussion which flows from it, but this appears only superficially in the text. The theological and pastoral comments are somewhat pedestrian and the methodology is not clearly justified by this solitary example. W. N. READ

THE FOURTH LESSON IN THE DAILY OFFICE: BOOK I. *Edited by Christopher Campling.* Darton, Longman & Todd, 1973. 367 pp. £3.50.

These, as the title page makes clear, are Readings from outside Scripture for the Weekdays and Holy Days of a year; designed for use with the three Lessons in the Daily Office of the Joint Liturgical Group ('Series II, Revised').

The Church was very wise when it laid down that its clergy should have, as the structure of their devotional life, the duty of saying Morning and Evening Prayer. Many outside the Church of England are aware of that wisdom, and the Joint Liturgical Group has been conscious of the fact. With the blessing of the Daily Office goes a danger—that the user of the Office shall rush through it and think that he has done his work for the day! That way lies barrenness, if not disaster. This book will help to avert such a fate. For it puts into our hands readings which, while not being commentaries on the Scripture passages appointed for the day, are nevertheless related to the themes to which the particular seasons of the Church's year direct us.

Thus, to take two examples, passages from Charles Williams' *The Descent of the Dove* are chosen for Whit-week and the season of Trinity and—such is the catholicity of taste of the Editor!—passages from C. H. Spurgeon's *A Treasury of Great Sermons on the Resurrection of Christ* for Easter Week.

Providing that these Readings do not draw us away from direct meditation on Scripture itself, they will be a help to us. The reviewer at least looks forward to some riches as he uses the book. (Would it be a good idea at some time to produce a similar book, only consisting of direct commentary on the appointed passages of Scripture, if someone could be found able to do it after the fashion of William Temple in his *Readings in St. John's Gospel*?)

It would be of help to have the page references of the passages quoted, for readers might well be incited to look them up in their context. And an index of authors would be a further benefit. DONALD EBOR